

Fostering Citizenship Education: A Content Analysis of School Curricula in Punjab, Pakistan.**Sarwat Naheed Chaudhary**

PhD Scholar (Education)

Department of Educational Research and Assessment, University of Okara

sarwatnaheedch@gmail.com**Dr. Nadia Gilani**

Assistant Professor

Department of Educational Studies, University of Okara

nadia.gilani@uo.edu.pk**Dr. Syed Abdul Waheed**

Assistant Professor

Department of Educational studies, University of Okara

s.a.waheed@uo.edu.pk**Abstract**

The current study aims to analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan, and the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical, and practical dimensions of citizenship education. The main research question was how much the school curriculum reflects the content of citizenship education, and to what extent the content of the school curriculum addresses the development and fostering of active citizenship among students. This study was based on quantitative content analysis. For this purpose, the textbooks of the Punjab textbook board from grades 1 to 10 were selected, which could have traces of citizenship education. For conducting content analysis, a framework of citizenship (EACER Eurydice, 2017) was selected as the research instrument, which had four major areas, and each one had its further sub-categories. It was concluded that the content showed more reflections of areas 1 and 3, which were about constructive interaction and being responsible towards others, whereas the least traces were identified of areas 2 and 4, which were about critical thinking and democratic behaviour. It was recommended to include a standalone subject of Citizenship Education in the curriculum.

Keywords: Citizenship, Citizenship Education. Fostering, PTB, Punjab

Introduction

Schools play a vital role in fostering and instilling citizenship education through their curriculum. The schools must integrate the development of cognitive processes, such as critical and reflective thinking, problem-solving skills, and dynamic and active learning, through both inside and outside classroom activities to foster citizenship. Following the guidelines from the school curriculum, the teachers may arrange discussions, assign projects based on social work, and weekly or monthly group debates to cover moral, social, political, critical, and legal dimensions of citizenship education. (Mutch, 2004). The teachers should not mix citizenship education with religious education. All the administration of the school, from the administrators to the class teachers, should work hard and play their respective duties to foster citizenship education in students, not only in a local but also in a global perspective. (O'Brien & Parry, 2002) The citizenship education works as a basic constituent in educational modification by inculcating democratic thinking, critical thinking, and volunteerism for participating in social work. (Plumpton, 2024)

Schools should teach their students citizenship from their initial classes because citizenship education encompasses how people behave and participate in society. It covers social, political, and religious knowledge, human attitudes, and living skills. Schools should teach their students to develop tolerance and mutual respect for other citizens who might have different opinions and points of view. (Daas & Munnikma, 2023) From the start of this century, the developed countries started focusing on the need for citizenship education in the schools because of globalization and diverse social cohesion. Schools can be taken as the first and most important place where students can learn how to behave socially and how to participate democratically in a pluralistic circle. (Flangan & Stout, 2010 20(3))The last twenty-five years have played their vital role in highlighting and transforming the need for citizenship education in schools. In citizenship education, the students are guided to find and explore their social identities, their rights and duties as citizens of the concerned nation. The teachers teach them to value not only themselves but also their fellow beings based on equality, justice, peace and mutual harmony. (Keating, 2016)

The concept of citizenship has a broad spectrum. It covers legal identities like a national card and a passport, social duties and rights, and social responsibilities like voting in the elections and tax payments, volunteering for social welfare and noble causes. (Joppke, 2007) In his study, Keating (2014) made the notable point that citizens worldwide learn values, norms, attitudes, and behaviour from their environment. They do not inherit them. That is why he emphasized the role of school in teaching and educating students regarding all necessary attributes and dimensions of good citizenship. (Keating, 2016)

Gorard (2010) claimed that schools and citizenship are closely linked and interrelated to each other since the 18th century because he took educational institutions or schools as a medium or instrument to identify and solve social issues of the concerned society. Education and citizenship have a vital bond, and schools play their role in teaching students about civic sense. According to

cognitive experts, education literate students and develop their mental, social, cognitive, psychosocial, behavioural, emotional, religious and moral dimensions so that the students may enable themselves to receive, understand and respond to all information around them regarding society, politics and religion. (Whiteley, 2005) Education starts refining students from their early age to understand civic engagement and their responsibilities. Gradually, with higher qualifications, students can feel the long-lasting impacts of citizenship education on their lives. (Niemi & Junn, 2005)

A school takes its curriculum as an instrument or a valuable tool to teach its students directly or indirectly all possible dimensions of citizenship. The schools play their role through their formal and hidden curriculum in the cultivation and inculcation of citizenship values, norms, beliefs, rights, sense of responsibility, political and democratic sense, mutual respect and critical thinking and decision making in the students. (Flanagan & Gallay, 2007) In developed countries, schools do not focus on just theoretical knowledge of citizenship, but also provide opportunities to students to practice citizenship by working with the community and engaging and participating in social work, for example, social work on a volunteer basis. raising funds for charities, raising money to pay fees of the poor students, small social projects and instructional tasks to understand and resolve social issues of the community. Such activities enable the students to get experiential learning through the development of civic skills. (Audsley, J, et al, 2013) Schools have a great responsibility to cultivate and inculcate citizenship in students, not only for the sake of youth but also for the sake of the entire society (Gorard, 2020)

The inculcation of citizenship through citizenship education is highly important for every society but unfortunately, in developing and under developed countries, if they ignore citizenship education, their society tends to face severe drawbacks like distribution of unequal resources among different classes of society, suppression of marginalized groups of society, severe violations of human rights because power belongs to wrong hands and they use it for their illegal interests, racial and ethnic issues, unequal opportunities of education, gender discrimination issues, disproportionate and unequal medical and health care for the individuals, lack of democracy, lack of social and political unpredictability, lack of social strength, lack of economic instability, lack of decision making, lack of critical thinking, lack of freedom of self-expression, severe unrest of youth leading to violence because of disempowerment, terrorism, street crimes, unemployment, development of destructive or terror groups in society, lack of legal shield and protection for individuals, increasing unproductivity and disappointment within people of society, detachment between people and the government, lack of mutual trust and respect, lack of social accountability and increase in corruption and vulnerability of citizens. (John & Nick, 2015)

In Pakistan, like other developing countries, citizenship is not a stand-alone subject in the curriculum but is integrated into other subjects like Pakistan Studies, Social Studies, Geography, Urdu, and English. A study of (Muhammad, 2019) showed that in Pakistani curricula, Pakistan Studies is most closely associated with Citizenship Education. The author further claimed that Pakistani teachers wanted to see Pakistani students as good citizens and true Muslims as well,

because they appreciated and desired a more Islamic perspective on human values within society. This study explained the role of the school curriculum in citizenship education and how citizenship could be taught to school students.

1.1 Statement of the Problem

When a society does not focus on citizenship education, the people become the victims of misinformation, lack of knowledge, economic instability, political decline, lack of knowledge of fundamental human rights, social conflicts, corruption, terrorism, lack of confidence and social disharmony. (Pimpton, 2025) In every society, schools may play their dynamic role in educating youth about citizenship. The school teaches the students about morality, ethics, fundamental human rights, problem-solving and critical thinking skills, responsibilities in a diverse culture, active participation in society and maintaining social harmony through curriculum, teaching methodologies and a favourable outer environment. (Birla, 2025).

Like other developing countries, Pakistan is not focusing on the vital need of citizenship education, which is why Pakistani students face challenges both at the national and global levels. They face injustice, inequality, unlawfulness, corruption, intolerance, discrimination, disrespect, political instability, economic setbacks, lack of basic fundamental human rights, freedom of expression, lack of social welfare and lack of democratic opportunities. (Perveen, 2018) The Pakistani curriculum does not enable students to think critically to bring sustainable social change. (Naseer, 2012). This disturbing situation points out the significance of curriculum in citizenship education. Therefore, this study focused on “The role of curriculum in fostering citizenship education in Pakistan”

1.2 Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the study were to:

- analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan.
- study the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical and practical dimensions of citizenship education.

1.3 Research Questions

Research questions for this current study were:

- How much does the school curriculum reflect the content of citizenship education?
- To what extent does the content of the school curriculum address the development and fostering of active citizenship among students?

1.4 Significance of the study

In the Pakistani school curriculum, the subject of citizenship education is not included as a standalone or compulsory subject, whereas it is integrated with other subjects like social studies,

Pakistan studies, geography, history, Urdu and English. It is the need of the time to rethink and add a mandatory subject of citizenship education to promote active and participatory dimensions of citizenship education among young students. (Dean, 2005)

A study (Hina et al., 2011) cited the fundamental components of active citizenship education that need to be focused on in the school curriculum, like an understanding of nature and the characteristics of society. gender roles and the nature of mutual relationships of the common public, an understanding of common rights and duties for each other, a belief in no gender discrimination or gender biases, an understanding of the effectiveness of democratic decisions, an understanding of basic laws and justice among people, critical thinking, and active participatory skills.

In developing countries, the public faces many problems because of a lack of citizenship, like low political vision, less public information, and a low public literacy rate. passive attitude towards fellow beings with minimum participatory skills, lack of public welfare activities, less understanding of mutual rights and duties, lack of interest in social work and democratic decisions, less understanding of social and global issues, lack of volunteerism for the common good, social, emotional and moral manipulation, high ratio of vulnerability among people and less information of social ground realities of that society. (Jamieson, 2010) Like other developing countries, the Pakistani youth also face these problems. Therefore, the findings of this study would highlight the need for more content on citizenship in the school curriculum to lead the school students to develop active, dynamic, and participatory citizenship skills.

Citizenship education is inevitable for developing nations like Pakistan because it develops democratic thinking, decision-making, social unity and harmony, confidence, and resilience in the students to enable them to play their role as active citizens and a beacon of light for the other stakeholders of the society. Citizenship education, through the school curriculum, enables human beings to understand fundamental human rights, law, and justice for all, so that individuals can work for their society to save them from unstable political conditions and acute corruption. For developing social peace and harmony, economic well-being, justice, protecting the environment, unity, and national strength to avoid and resolve small and big conflicts, developing patriotism, sense of belongingness, and accepting diverse religious and social values, citizenship education can play its vital role in teaching respect for one another, tolerating others' points of view, and conflict resolution. (Parliament, 2023)

Citizenship education demands that teachers use modern and innovative methodologies to increase their own professional skills. Teachers play a vital role in citizenship education because they give practical shape to all that is written in textbooks with their instruction, demonstration, discussion, modifications, values, and behaviour within the school environment. Through the school curriculum of citizenship education, the students gradually learn decision-making based on critical thinking and problem-solving, interacting with others, resolving personal and social issues, rights and duties, the sense of freedom and responsibility, and safeguarding personal and others'

rights. The students develop initiative and volunteerism for social work to develop social bonds among the community and resolve local issues easily. The responsible citizens always help the government to run the affairs smoothly, democratically, and effectively. The citizenship education helps the curriculum developers and policy makers to devise such a mechanism and framework to develop moral, religious, economic, political, democratic, and social values in students. Creating a balance between theory and practice of learning experiences regarding citizenship education is a challenging task for curriculum developers. (Akbar, 2025)

1.5 Delimitations of the Study

To achieve the research objectives, 1. To analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan, and 2. To study the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical and practical dimensions of citizenship education, this study was delimited to the selected subjects from the school curriculum of the Punjab Textbook Board of Pakistan to analyze all the possible traces of citizenship education. The details are as follows:

Grades and Selected subjects
Grade 1: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 2: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 3: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 4: Social studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic studies
Grade 5: Social studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic studies
Grade 6: Urdu, English, Islamic Studies, and Geography
Grade 7: English, Urdu, Islamic Studies and Geography
Grade 8: Urdu, English, Islamic Studies and Geography
Grade 9: Pakistan Studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic Studies
Grade 10: Pakistan Studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic Studies

1.5 Methodology of the Study

This study was based on quantitative content analysis. The quantitative content analysis is a useful research method that encompasses textual, audio and video data that are gathered and arranged systematically so that they can be analyzed. The most important feature of content analysis is its coding, or a specific framework that includes a set of indicators that need to be looked for in the textual content. A useful and successful content analysis needs to combine some significant aspects, like careful segmentation and selection of the text and using a reliable framework of coding that thoroughly covers that specific topic. (Coe & Scacco, 2017)

1.6 Population and Sample

To conduct quantitative content analysis, the textbooks of the Punjab Textbook Board from grades 1 to 10 were taken, and for the sample, all those subjects were selected that could have possible traces of citizenship education

1.7 Research Instrument

For quantitative content analysis, the researcher sought to employ a framework that could encompass all important dimensions and their subcategories of citizenship education. After extensive reading, the researcher selected a comprehensive and wide-ranging framework of citizenship education from a European report, “Citizenship Education at School in Europe 2017”, which not only covered vital areas of citizenship education but also its detailed subcategories. It covered four vital areas, like dimensions of constructive and effective interaction with people and their sub-categories, the dimension of behaving responsibly with its sub-competencies, the aspect of critical thinking and all its further sub-categories and the major dimension of participating in society and acting democratically with its sub-competencies. (EACER Eurydice, 2017)

1.9 Data Collection and Data Analysis

To conduct quantitative content analysis, the researcher arranged the selected books from grades 1 to 10 of the Punjab Textbook Board. After careful and extensive reading of those books, content analysis was done by using the concise framework of citizenship education (EACER Eurydice, 2017) . This framework had 4 major areas, and each area had its further sub-categories or further competencies. The researcher conducted the content analysis through careful and extensive reading of the texts to find out all possible traces and reflections of citizenship education. The researcher tabulated the data to show the traces of citizenship education according to the instrument that had major areas and their further sub-categories.

Table 1.

Grade 1. Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively constructively	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act And democratically
Subject	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 4 (%)
English 90%	46%	55%	36%	
Urdu	92%	42%	52%	35%
General 77%	64%	80%	52%	
Knowledge				

Table 1 shows that in the English textbook grade 1, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 46% of sub-categories from area 2, 55% sub-categories from area 3 and 36% sub-categories from area 4 were found. In the textbook of Urdu grade 1, 92% of the sub-categories from area 1, 42% sub-categories from area 2, 52% sub-categories from area 3 and 35% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 1, 77% of sub-categories of area 1, 64% sub-categories from area 2, 80% sub-categories from area 3 and 52% sub-categories from area 4 were found.

Table 2.

Grade 2. Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively and constructively	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To a And democratically
Subject	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	64%	53%	29%	35%
Urdu	90%	98%	96%	52%
General	85%	77%	95%	73%

Knowledge

Table 2 shows that in the English textbook for grade 2, 64% of sub-categories from area 1, 53% of sub-categories from area 2, 29% of sub-categories from area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 2, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 98% sub-categories from area 2, 96% sub-categories from area 3 and 52% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 2, 85% of the sub-categories of area 1, 77% sub-categories from area 2, 95% sub-categories from area 3 and 73% sub-categories from area 4 were traced.

Table 3.

Grade 3. Grade 2. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	To think critically sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	To act in a socially responsible manner sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	To act democratically sub-categories in Area. 4 (%)
English	56%	40%	60%	22%
Urdu	90%	95%	96%	38%
General Knowledge	91%	87%	88%	60%
Islamiyat	90%	60%	68%	36%

Table 3 shows that in the English textbook for grade 3, 56% of sub-categories from area 1, 40% of sub-categories from area 2, 60% of sub-categories from area 3, and 22% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 3, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 95% sub-categories from area 2, 96% sub-categories from area 3 and 38% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 3, 91% of the sub-categories of area 1, 87% sub-categories from area 2, 88% sub-categories from area 3 and 60% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 60% of sub-categories from area 2, 68% of sub-categories from area 3, and 36% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 4.

Grade 4 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	To think critically sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	To act in a socially responsible manner sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	To act democratically sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	64%	80%	48%
Urdu	90%	88%	95%	47%
Social Studies	95%	96%	94%	85%
Islamiyat	90%	76%	88%	24%

Table 4. shows that in the English textbook for grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 64% of sub-categories from area 2, 80% of sub-categories from area 3, and 48% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 4, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 88% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 47% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Social Studies grade 4, 95% of sub-categories of area 1, 96% of sub-categories from area 2, 94% sub-categories from area 3 and 85% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 88% of sub-categories from area 3, and 24% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 5.

Grade 5. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	To think critically sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	To act in a socially responsible manner sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	To act democratically sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	88%	80%	35%

Urdu	82%	95%	96%	23%
Social Studies	96%	96%	95%	86%
Islamiyat	90%	76%	96%	35%

Table 5. shows that in the English textbook for grade 5, 90% of sub-categories from Area 1, 88% of sub-categories from Area 2, 80% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 5, 82% of the sub-categories from area 1, 95% of sub-categories from area 2, 96% of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Social Studies grade 5, 96% of sub-categories of area 1, 96% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 86% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 5, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 96% of sub-categories from area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 6.

Grade 6. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	To think critically sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	To act in a socially responsible manner sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	To act democratically sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	88%	60%	10%
Urdu	32%	20%	70%	10%
Islamiyat	55%	zero%	70%	23%
Geography	6%	76%	55%	zero%

Table 6. shows that in the English textbook for grade 6, 90% of sub-categories from Area 1, 88% of sub-categories from Area 2, 60% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 6, 32% of the sub-categories from area 1, 20% of sub-categories from area 2, 70% of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 6, 55% of sub-categories of area 1, 0%

% of sub-categories from area 2, 70% of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 6, 6% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 55% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 7.

Grade 7. Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively And constructively	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act democratically
Subject	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	56%	32%	61%	35%
Urdu	57%	20%	52%	52%
Islamiyat	55%	10%	62%	23%
Geography	0%	76%	34%	0%

Table 7. shows that in the English textbook for grade 7, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 32% of sub-categories from Area 2, 61% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 7, 57% of the sub-categories from area 1, 20% of sub-categories from area 2, 52% of sub-categories from area 3 and 52% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 7, 55% of sub-categories of area 1, 10% % of sub-categories from area 2, 62% of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 7, 0% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 34% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 8.

Grade 8. Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively and constructively	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act democratically
Subject	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)

English	40%	32%	62%	10%
Urdu	52%	10%	95%	14%
Islamiyat	65%	24%	52%	27%
Geography	7%	76%	52%	0%

Table 8. shows that in the English textbook for grade 8, 40% of sub-categories from Area 1, 32% of sub-categories from Area 2, 62% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 8, 52% of the sub-categories from area 1, 10% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 14% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 8, 65% of sub-categories of area 1, 24% % of sub-categories from area 2, 52%of sub-categories from area 3 and 27% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 8, 7% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 52% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 9.

Grade 9 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively		To think critically		To act in a socially responsible manner		To act democratically	
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)		sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)		sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)		sub-categories in Area.4 (%)	
English	5	6%	64%	80%	10%			
Urdu	32%		32%	53%	10%			
Islamiyat	51%		0%	16%	10%			
Pakistan	56%		54%	90%	77%			

Table 9. shows that in the English textbook for grade 9, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 64% of sub-categories from Area 2, 80% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the Urdu textbook for grade 9, 32% of the sub-categories from area 1, 32% of the sub-categories from area 2, 53% of the sub-categories from area 3, and 10% of the sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 9, 51% of sub-

categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 16%of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Pakistan Studies, grade 9, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 54% of sub-categories from Area 2, 90% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 77% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified.

Table 10.

Grade 10 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively and constructively	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act democratically
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	65%	54%	16%	0%
Urdu	31%	0%	43%	10%
Islamiyat	64%	0%	43%	10%
Pakistan Studies	15%	21%	61%	77%

Table 10 shows that in the English textbook for grade 10, 65% of sub-categories from Area 1, 54% of sub-categories from Area 2, 16% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the Urdu textbook for grade 10, 31% of the sub-categories from area 1, 0% of the sub-categories from area 2, 43% of the sub-categories from area 3, and 10% of the sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 10, 64% of sub-categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 43%of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Pakistan Studies, grade 10, 15% of sub-categories from Area 1, 21% of sub-categories from Area 2, 61% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 77% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified.

1.8 Discussion

Young Citizens (2025) stated that the need for citizenship education has never been greater in this century. It has become the basic need of the hour because it helps the youth to acquire skills like critical thinking, media awareness, and active social participation to face new challenges like handling global climatic changes, inculcation of ethical and moral values, and understanding the fabrication of information at the national and global levels. The provision of citizenship education can play its vital role in fostering respect, acceptance and courtesy for diverse cultures in society, social involvement to ensure justice for all and the ability to distinguish between information and

misinformation to behave responsibly and sensibly in this interconnected and global world. (Citizens, 2025)

Societies that believe in democracy and equality need citizens who can think critically and responsibly to act mindfully, not only for themselves but also for the underprivileged and marginalized groups within society. Such confident, volunteer, and participative individuals take the lead to contribute to social affairs to meet challenges of society and safeguard the people from bullying, injustice and discrimination. The provision of citizenship education is the only way to produce such individuals who are beneficial for the whole society and always take the lead to raise their voice against prejudice, social inequality, intolerance, disrespect and misleading information. (Academy, 2021)

The developed countries, like the UK, the USA, and New Zealand, have already realized the importance and significance of citizenship education in their respective curricula. A British report, "The Ties that Bind", of the House of Lords session 2017-19 (2018) stated that the journey of refined and active citizenship starts with educating young students at school. The citizenship education gradually enables them to understand their active and participatory social roles within society. They explore their abilities and capabilities to perform their duties of active, responsible and well-informed citizens to improve their own lives and those of others. The British government urged shared values to be focused in their citizenship education. They believe that active and participatory citizenship encompasses respect, acceptance, courtesy, non-violence, political and social awareness, justice, social welfare, democratic approach and understanding of human fundamental rights. (Lords, 2018)

In developing countries like Pakistan, there is no mandatory or compulsory subject of citizenship education in the school curriculum. Regardless its different components have been integrated in different other subjects but it is great need of the time to re think and re visit the curriculum to save the declining society and its values. When a society does not focus on educating citizenship to its citizens, it slowly becomes a crowd of animals instead of refined and sensible citizens. People of that society become the victims of misinformation, social injustice, unlawfulness, discrimination, political and social bullying, violence, political and economic instability, and overall social disharmony. (Dean, 2005)

1.9 Conclusion

- It was concluded from the content analysis of the textbooks of the Punjab textbook board from grades 1 to 10 that there was no compulsory or mandatory subject of citizenship education in the school curriculum, but the traces and reflections of different areas of citizenship were identified in the taught subjects like English, Urdu, Islamiyat, General knowledge, Social Studies, Pakistan Studies and Geography. It was also concluded that the traces of all four areas and of their sub-categories were not the same. The sub-categories from area 1 (To interact effectively and constructively) and area 3 (To act in a socially

responsible manner) were more reflected in the content of textbooks from grades 1 to 10 than the sub-categories from area 2 (To think critically) and area 4 (To act democratically).

- From the perspective of alignment of the content of school curriculum from grades 1 to 10 with active, practical and participatory citizenship, it was concluded that the sub-categories from area 1 (to act effectively and constructively) were aligned with active citizenship because the contents regarding confidence building, respect, courtesy and tolerance have been added. The matter of alignment with active and participative citizenship was the same in area 3 (to act in a socially responsible manner) because the contents regarding self-concept and awareness, how to communicate and behave responsibly, emotional well-being, flexible attitude, responsibilities in diverse cultures, patriotism, solidarity and rights and responsibilities have been added.
- It was concluded that the sub-categories of area 2 (To think critically) and area 4 (To act democratically) were not well aligned with the contents of the curriculum from grades 1 to 10 because the sub-categories, like developing multi-perspectivity, how to develop reasoning skills, how to use judgments, how to discover new ways of problem solving, how to compete globally, understanding and acting in a democracy, knowing political processes, awareness of international organizations and their treaties have been least identified from the contents.
- It was recommended that a solid action plan was needed to develop the active and participative side of citizenship education in Pakistan. To avoid moral decline and decay of social and moral values, a compulsory subject of Citizenship/ Civic education may be added to the school curriculum, and the government authorities should legalize it in both public and private institutions. Only the addition of theoretical content would not be enough; a productive and willing mindset for learning practical skills for participatory citizenship may be needed. Different discussions, seminars and training sessions may be arranged for school teachers to train them for different aspects of citizenship education.

References

- Academy, T. G. (2021, March 16). *The Importance of Global Citizenship in 21st Century*. Retrieved from <https://www.theglobalcitizenacademy.com/blog/the-importance-of-global-citizenship-in-the-21st-century>: www.google.com
- Akbar, A. (2025). Integrating Citizenship Education In The National Curriculum: Challenges And Opportunities. *Jurnal Edukasi Terkini 1 (1)*, 8-19.
- Audsley, J., Chitty, C., O", C. J., Watson, D. M., & Wills, J. (2013, April 26). *Citizen Schools: Learning to rebuild democracy*. Retrieved from IPPR (online) [http// www.ippr.org/publications/55/11162/ citizenship school-learning to rebuild democracy](http://www.ippr.org/publications/55/11162/citizenship-school-learning-to-rebuild-democracy).

- Birla, A. (2025, September). *Democracy and Education: The Role of Schools in Building Responsible Citizens*. Retrieved from <https://saralabirilaacademy.org/blog/democracy-and-education-role-of-schools/>: www.google.com
- Citizens, Y. (2025, september 18). *Importance of Citizenship Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.youngcitizens.org/resources/citizenship/importance-of-citizenship-education/>: www.google.com
- Coe, K., & Scacco, J. M. (2017). Quantitative Content Analysis. Florida, U.S.A: the International Encyclopedia of Communication Research Methods.
- Daas, D. R., & Munniksma, D. A. (2023, October 26). *What is the role of education in developing citizenship competencies*. Retrieved from <https://www.uva.nl/en/shared-content/faculteiten/en/faculteit-der-maatschappij-en-gedragswetenschappen/news/2021/02/elections---role-of-citizenship-education.html?cb:www.google.com>
- Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and*, 35-55.
- EACER Eurydice, E. (2017). *Citizenship Education in School in Europe*. Luxembourg: Eurydice Report Luxembourg Publications Office of the European Union.
- Flanagan, C. A., & Gallay, L. S. (2007). School and Community Climates and Civic Commitments: Pptterns for ethnic minority and majority students. *Journal of Educational Psychology*99(2), 421-431.
- Flangan, C. A., & Stout, M. (2010 20(3)). Developmental patterns of social trust between early and late adolescence: Age and school climate effects. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 748-773.
- Gorard, S. (2020). Education can compensate for society ---- a Bit. *British Journal of Educational Studies* 58(1), 47-65.
- Hina, K., Dr, A. M., & Fazalur Rahman, D. (2011). State of Citizenship Education: A Case Study from Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Vol. 1 No. 2*.
- Jamieson, K. H. (2010). The Challenges Facing Civic Education. *American Academy of Arts and Science*.
- John, D., & Nick, H. (2015). The social psychology of citizenship, Participatiion and social exclusion: Introduction to the Special Thematic Section. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology* 3(2), 1-19.

- Joppke, C. (2007). Transformation of citizenship: Status, Rights, Identity. *Citizenship Studies* 11(1), 37-48.
- Keating, A. (2016). Educating tomorrow's citizens: What role can school play? *Forum de Education* 14(20), 35-47.
- Lords, T. H. (2018). *The Ties that Bind: Citizenship and Civic Engagement in 21st Century*. online at <https://www.parliament.uk/citizenship-civic-engagement>.
- Muhammad, Y. (2019). Pakistani National Identity, Curriculum Reform and Citizenship Education Textbooks: Understanding Teachers' Perspectives. *Journal of Research and Reflection in Education*, Vol 13.No. 1, 103-122.
- Mutch, C. (2004, September 8). *Citizenship education: does it have a place*. Retrieved from <https://www.gcedclearinghouse.org/sites/default/files/resources/Citizenship%20education.pdf>: Services-Citizenship-requirements
- Naseer, R. (2012). Citizenship Education in Pakistan . *Pakistaniaat: A Journal of Pakistan Studies* Vol. 4, No. 3.
- Niemi, R. G., & Junn, J. (2005). *Civic Education: What Makes Students Learn?* New Haven CT: Yale University Press.
- O'Brien, M., & Parry, L. (2002). From national identity to global citizenship: Challenges for citizenship education in Australia. *The International Journal of Social Education*, 17(1), 31-40.
- Parliament, E. (2023). *Citizenship education in national curricula*. Retrieved from [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2023/747459/EPRS_BRI\(2023\)747459_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2023/747459/EPRS_BRI(2023)747459_EN.pdf): www.google.com
- Perveen, M. (2018). *Analysis of Curriculum with respect to citizenship education at sendary level in Punjab*. Retrieved from <http://pr.hec.gov.pk/jspui/bitstream/123456789/12069/1/Memuna%20perveen%20education%202018%20umt%20lhr%20pr.pdf>.
- Pimpton, A. (2025, September). *Teaching Citizenship: How Can We Prepare the Next Generation for the Complexities of Today's World?* Retrieved from <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/teaching-citizenship-how-can-we-prepare-the-next-generation-for-the-complexities-of-todays-world/>: www.google.com
- Plumpton, A. (2024, February). *Teaching Citizenship: How Can We Prepare the Next Generation for the Complexities of Today's World?* Retrieved from

<https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/teaching-citizenship-how-can-we-prepare-the-next-generation-for-the-complexities-of-todays-world/>: www.google.com

Whiteley, P. (2005). *Citizenship Education Longitudinal Study Second Literature Review. Citizenship Education:: the political science perspective (DfES) Research Report 631. .* London: Department for Education and Skills.

192-Other-532-1-2- 20250920.docx

by Jies

Submission date: 08-Oct-2025 12:50AM (UTC-0700)

Submission ID: 2740102883

File name: 192-Other-532-1-2-20250920.docx (68.62K)

Word count: 5674

Character count: 32994

A Content Analysis Study on the State of Curriculum Fostering Citizenship Education in Punjab, Pakistan

Abstract

The current study aims to analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan, and the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical, and practical dimensions of citizenship education. The main research question was how much the school curriculum reflects the content of citizenship education, and to what extent the content of the school curriculum addresses the development and fostering of active citizenship among students. This study was based on quantitative content analysis. For this purpose, the textbooks of the Punjab textbook board from grades 1 to 10 were selected, which could have traces of citizenship education. For conducting content analysis, a framework of citizenship (EACER Eurydice, 2017) was selected as the research instrument, which had four major areas, and each one had its further sub-categories. It was concluded that the content showed more reflections of areas 1 and 3, which were about constructive interaction and being responsible towards others, whereas the least traces were identified of areas 2 and 4, which were about critical thinking and democratic behaviour. It was recommended to include a standalone subject of Citizenship Education in the curriculum.

Keywords: Citizenship, Citizenship Education, Fostering, PTB, Punjab

Introduction

Schools should teach their students citizenship from their initial classes because citizenship education encompasses how people behave and participate in society. It covers social, political, and religious knowledge, human attitudes, and living skills. Schools should teach their students to develop tolerance and mutual respect for other citizens who might have different opinions and points of view. (Daas & Munniksmma, 2023) From the start of this century, the developed countries started focusing on the need for citizenship education in the schools because of globalization and diverse social cohesion. Schools can be taken as the first and most important place where students can learn how to behave socially and how to participate democratically in a pluralistic circle. (Flangan & Stout, 2010) The last twenty-five years have played their vital role in highlighting and transforming the need for citizenship education in schools. In citizenship education, the students are guided to find and explore their social identities, their rights and duties as citizens of the concerned nation. The teachers teach them to value not only themselves but also their fellow beings based on equality, justice, peace and mutual harmony. (Keating, 2016)

The concept of citizenship has a broad spectrum. It covers legal identities like a national card and a passport, social duties and rights, and social responsibilities like voting in the elections and tax payments, volunteering for social welfare and noble causes. (Joppke, 2007) In his study, Keating (2014) made the notable point that citizens worldwide learn values, norms, attitudes, and behaviour from their environment. They do not inherit them. That is why he emphasized the role of school in teaching and educating students regarding all necessary attributes and dimensions of good citizenship. (Keating, 2016)

Gorard (2010) claimed that schools and citizenship are closely linked and interrelated to each other since the 18th century because he took educational institutions or schools as a medium or instrument to identify and solve social issues of the concerned society. Education and citizenship have a vital bond, and schools play their role in teaching students about civic sense. According to cognitive

experts, education literate students and develop their mental, social, cognitive, psychosocial, behavioural, emotional, religious and moral dimensions so that the students may enable themselves to receive, understand and respond to all information around them regarding society, politics and religion. (Whiteley, 2005) Education starts refining students from their early age to understand civic engagement and their responsibilities. Gradually, with higher qualifications, students can feel the long-lasting impacts of citizenship education on their lives. (Niemi & Junn, 2005)

A school takes its curriculum as an instrument or a valuable tool to teach its students directly or indirectly all possible dimensions of citizenship. The schools play their role through their formal and hidden curriculum in the cultivation and inculcation of citizenship values, norms, beliefs, rights, sense of responsibility, political and democratic sense, mutual respect and critical thinking and decision making in the students. (Flanagan & Gallay, 2007) In developed countries, schools do not focus on just theoretical knowledge of citizenship, but also provide opportunities to students to practice citizenship by working with the community and engaging and participating in social work, for example, social work on a volunteer basis, raising funds for charities, raising money to pay fees of the poor students, small social projects and instructional tasks to understand and resolve social issues of the community. Such activities enable the students to get experiential learning through the development of civic skills. (Audsley, J, et al, 2013) Schools have a great responsibility to cultivate and inculcate citizenship in students, not only for the sake of youth but also for the sake of the entire society (Gorard, 2020)

The inculcation of citizenship through citizenship education is highly important for every society but unfortunately, in developing and under developed countries, if they ignore citizenship education, their society tends to face severe drawbacks like distribution of unequal resources among different classes of society, suppression of marginalized groups of society, severe violations of human rights because power belongs to wrong hands and they use it for their illegal interests, racial and ethnic issues, unequal opportunities of education, gender discrimination issues, disproportionate and unequal medical and health care for the individuals, lack of democracy, lack of social and political unpredictability, lack of social strength, lack of economic instability, lack of decision making, lack of critical thinking, lack of freedom of self-expression, severe unrest of youth leading to violence because of disempowerment, terrorism, street crimes, unemployment, development of destructive or terror groups in society, lack of legal shield and protection for individuals, increasing unproductivity and disappointment within people of society, detachment between people and the government, lack of mutual trust and respect, lack of social accountability and increase in corruption and vulnerability of citizens. (John & Nick, 2015)

In Pakistan, like other developing countries, citizenship is not a stand-alone subject in the curriculum but is integrated into other subjects like Pakistan Studies, Social Studies, Geography, Urdu, and English. A study of (Muhammad, 2019) showed that in Pakistani curricula, Pakistan Studies is most closely associated with Citizenship Education. The author further claimed that Pakistani teachers wanted to see Pakistani students as good citizens and true Muslims as well, because they appreciated and desired a more Islamic perspective on human values within society. This study explained the role of the school curriculum in citizenship education and how citizenship could be taught to school students.

1.1 Statement of the Problem

When a society does not focus on citizenship education, the people become the victims of misinformation, lack of knowledge, economic instability, political decline, lack of knowledge of fundamental human rights, social conflicts, corruption, terrorism, lack of confidence and social

disharmony. (Pimpton, 2025) In every society, schools may play their dynamic role in educating youth about citizenship. The school teaches the students about morality, ethics, fundamental human rights, problem-solving and critical thinking skills, responsibilities in a diverse culture, active participation in society and maintaining social harmony through curriculum, teaching methodologies and a favourable outer environment. (Birla, 2025).

Like other developing countries, Pakistan is not focusing on the vital need of citizenship education, which is why Pakistani students face challenges both at the national and global levels. They face injustice, inequality, unlawfulness, corruption, intolerance, discrimination, disrespect, political instability, economic setbacks, lack of basic fundamental human rights, freedom of expression, lack of social welfare and lack of democratic opportunities. (Perveen, 2018) The Pakistani curriculum does not enable students to think critically to bring sustainable social change. (Naseer, 2012). This disturbing situation points out the significance of curriculum in citizenship education. Therefore, this study focused on “The role of curriculum in fostering citizenship education in Pakistan”

⁵ 1.2 Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the study were to:

- analyze ³ the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan.
- study the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical and practical dimensions of citizenship education.

⁸ 1.3 Research Questions

Research questions for this current study were:

- How much does the school curriculum reflect the content of citizenship education?
- To what extent does the content of the school curriculum address the development and fostering of active citizenship among students?

1.4 Significance of the study

⁵ In the Pakistani school curriculum, the subject of citizenship education is ⁴ not included as a standalone or compulsory subject, whereas it is integrated with other subjects like social studies, Pakistan studies, geography, history, Urdu and English. It is the need of the time to rethink and add a mandatory subject of citizenship education to promote active and participatory dimensions of citizenship education among young students. (Dean, 2005)

A study (Hina et al., 2011) cited the fundamental components of active citizenship education that need to be focused on in the school curriculum, like an understanding of nature and the characteristics of society, gender roles and the nature of mutual relationships of the common public, an understanding of common rights and duties for each other, a belief in no gender discrimination or gender biases, an understanding of the effectiveness of democratic decisions, an understanding of basic laws and justice among people, critical thinking, and active participatory skills.

In developing countries, the public faces many problems because of a lack of citizenship, like low political vision, less public information, and a low public literacy rate. passive attitude towards fellow beings with minimum participatory skills, lack of public welfare activities, less understanding

of mutual rights and duties, lack of interest in social work and democratic decisions, less understanding of social and global issues, lack of volunteerism for the common good, social, emotional and moral manipulation, high ratio of vulnerability among people and less information of social ground realities of that society. (Jamieson, 2010) Like other developing countries, the Pakistani youth also face these problems. Therefore, the findings of this study would highlight the need for more content on citizenship in the school curriculum to lead the school students to develop active, dynamic and participatory citizenship skills.

1.5 Delimitations of the Study

To achieve the research objectives, 1. To analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan, and 2. To study the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical and practical dimensions of citizenship education, this study was delimited to the selected subjects from the school curriculum of the Punjab Textbook Board of Pakistan to analyze all the possible traces of citizenship education. The details are as follows:

Grades and Selected subjects
Grade 1: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 2: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 3: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 4: Social studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic studies
Grade 5: Social studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic studies
Grade 6: Urdu, English, Islamic Studies, and Geography
Grade 7: English, Urdu, Islamic Studies and Geography
Grade 8: Urdu, English, Islamic Studies and Geography
Grade 9: Pakistan Studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic Studies
Grade 10: Pakistan Studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic Studies

1.6 Methodology of the Study

This study was based on quantitative content analysis. The quantitative content analysis is a useful research method that encompasses textual, audio and video data that are gathered and arranged systematically so that they can be analyzed. The most important feature of content analysis is its coding, or a specific framework that includes a set of indicators that need to be looked for in the textual content. A useful and successful content analysis needs to combine some significant aspects, like careful segmentation and selection of the text and using a reliable framework of coding that thoroughly covers that specific topic. (Coe & Scacco, 2017)

1.7 Population and Sample

To conduct quantitative content analysis, the textbooks of the Punjab Textbook Board from grades 1 to 10 were taken, and for the sample, all those subjects were selected that could have possible traces of citizenship education

1.8 Research Instrument

For quantitative content analysis, the researcher sought to employ a framework that could encompass all important dimensions and their subcategories of citizenship education. After extensive reading, the researcher selected a comprehensive and wide-ranging framework of citizenship education from a European report, "Citizenship Education at School in Europe 2017", which not only covered vital areas of citizenship education but also its detailed subcategories. It covered four vital areas, like dimensions of constructive and effective interaction with people and their sub-categories, the dimension of behaving responsibly with its sub-competencies, the aspect of critical thinking and all its further sub-categories and the major dimension of participating in society and acting democratically with its sub-competencies. (EACER Eurydice, 2017)

1.9 Data Collection and Data Analysis

To conduct quantitative content analysis, the researcher arranged the selected books from grades 1 to 10 of the Punjab Textbook Board. After careful and extensive reading of those books, content analysis was done by using the concise framework of citizenship education (EACER Eurydice, 2017). This framework had 4 major areas, and each area had its further sub-categories or further competencies. The researcher conducted the content analysis through careful and extensive reading of the texts to find out all possible traces and reflections of citizenship education. The researcher tabulated the data to show the traces of citizenship education according to the instrument that had major areas and their further sub-categories.

Table 1.

Grade 1. Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
Subject	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 4 (%)
English 90%	46%	55%	36%	
Urdu	92%	42%	52%	35%
General 77%	64%	80%	52%	
Knowledge				

Table 1 shows that in the English textbook grade 1, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 46% of sub-categories from area 2, 55% sub-categories from area 3 and 36% sub-categories from area 4 were found. In the textbook of Urdu grade 1, 92% of the sub-categories from area 1, 42% sub-categories from area 2, 52% sub-categories from area 3 and 35% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 1, 77% of sub-categories of area 1, 64% sub-categories from area 2, 80% sub-categories from area 3 and 52% sub-categories from area 4 were found.

Table 2.

Grade 2. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	64%	53%	29%	35%
Urdu	90%	98%	96%	52%
General Knowledge	85%	77%	95%	73%

Table 2 shows that in the English textbook for grade 2, 64% of sub-categories from area 1, 53% of sub-categories from area 2, 29% of sub-categories from area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 2, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 98% sub-categories from area 2, 96% sub-categories from area 3 and 52% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 2, 85% of the sub-categories of area 1, 77% sub-categories from area 2, 95% sub-categories from area 3 and 73% sub-categories from area 4 were traced.

Table 3.

Grade 3. Grade 2. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 4 (%)
English	56%	40%	60%	22%

Urdu	90%	95%	96%	38%
General Knowledge	91%	87%	88%	60%
Islamiyat	90%	60%	68%	36%

Table 3 shows that in the English textbook for grade 3, 56% of sub-categories from area 1, 40% of sub-categories from area 2, 60% of sub-categories from area 3, and 22% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 3, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 95% sub-categories from area 2, 96% sub-categories from area 3 and 38% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 3, 91% of the sub-categories of area 1, 87% sub-categories from area 2, 88% sub-categories from area 3 and 60% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 60% of sub-categories from area 2, 68% of sub-categories from area 3, and 36% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 4.

Grade 4 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	64%	80%	48%
Urdu	90%	88%	95%	47%
Social Studies	95%	96%	94%	85%
Islamiyat	90%	76%	88%	24%

Table 4. shows that in the English textbook for grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 64% of sub-categories from area 2, 80% of sub-categories from area 3, and 48% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 4, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 88% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 47% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Social Studies grade 4, 95% of sub-categories of area 1, 96% of sub-categories from area 2, 94% sub-categories from area 3 and 85% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 88% of sub-categories from area 3, and 24% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 5.**Grade 5. Sub-categories of the four major areas**

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	88%	80%	35%
Urdu	82%	95%	96%	23%
Social Studies	96%	96%	95%	86%
Islamiyat	90%	76%	96%	35%

Table 5. shows that in the English textbook for grade 5, 90% of sub-categories from Area 1, 88% of sub-categories from Area 2, 80% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 5, 82% of the sub-categories from area 1, 95% of sub-categories from area 2, 96% of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Social Studies grade 5, 96% of sub-categories of area 1, 96% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 86% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 5, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 96% of sub-categories from area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 6.**Grade 6. Sub-categories of the four major areas**

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	88%	60%	10%
Urdu	32%	20%	70%	10%
Islamiyat	55%	zero%	70%	23%

Geography 6% 76% 55% zero%

Table 6. shows that in the English textbook for grade 6, 90% of sub-categories from Area 1, 88% of sub-categories from Area 2, 60% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 6, 32% of the sub-categories from area 1, 20% of sub-categories from area 2, 70% of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 6, 55% of sub-categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 70%of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 6, 6% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 55% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 7.

Grade 7. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	56%	32%	61%	35%
Urdu	57%	20%	52%	52%
Islamiyat	55%	10%	62%	23%
Geography	0%	76%	34%	0%

Table 7. shows that in the English textbook for grade 7, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 32% of sub-categories from Area 2, 61% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 7, 57% of the sub-categories from area 1, 20% of sub-categories from area 2, 52% of sub-categories from area 3 and 52% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 7, 55% of sub-categories of area 1, 10% % of sub-categories from area 2, 62%of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 7, 0% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 34% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 8.**Grade 8. Sub-categories of the four major areas**

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	40%	32%	62%	10%
Urdu	52%	10%	95%	14%
Islamiyat	65%	24%	52%	27%
Geography	7%	76%	52%	0%

Table 8. shows that in the English textbook for grade 8, 40% of sub-categories from Area 1, 32% of sub-categories from Area 2, 62% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 8, 52% of the sub-categories from area 1, 10% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 14% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 8, 65% of sub-categories of area 1, 24% % of sub-categories from area 2, 52% of sub-categories from area 3 and 27% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 8, 7% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 52% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 9.**Grade 9 Sub-categories of the four major areas**

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	56%	64%	80%	10%
Urdu	32%	32%	53%	10%
Islamiyat	51%	0%	16%	10%
Pakistan Studies	56%	54%	90%	77%

Table 9. shows that in the English textbook for grade 9, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 64% of sub-categories from Area 2, 80% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the Urdu textbook for grade 9, 32% of the sub-categories from area 1, 32% of the sub-categories from area 2, 53% of the sub-categories from area 3, and 10% of the sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 9, 51% of sub-categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 16%of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Pakistan Studies, grade 9, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 54% of sub-categories from Area 2, 90% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 77% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified.

Table 10.

Grade 10 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	65%	54%	16%	0%
Urdu	31%	0%	43%	10%
Islamiyat	64%	0%	43%	10%
Pakistan Studies	15%	21%	61%	77%

Table 10 shows that in the English textbook for grade 10, 65% of sub-categories from Area 1, 54% of sub-categories from Area 2, 16% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the Urdu textbook for grade 10, 31% of the sub-categories from area 1, 0% of the sub-categories from area 2, 43% of the sub-categories from area 3, and 10% of the sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 10, 64% of sub-categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 43%of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Pakistan Studies, grade 10, 15% of sub-categories from Area 1, 21% of sub-categories from Area 2, 61% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 77% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified.

1.9 Discussion

Young Citizens (2025) stated that the need for citizenship education has never been greater in this century. It has become the basic need of the hour because it helps the youth to acquire skills like critical thinking, media awareness, and active social participation to face new challenges like handling global climatic changes, inculcation of ethical and moral values, and understanding the fabrication of information at the national and global levels. The provision of citizenship education can play its vital role in fostering respect, acceptance and courtesy for diverse cultures in society, social involvement to

ensure justice for all and the ability to distinguish between information and misinformation to behave responsibly and sensibly in this interconnected and global world. (Citizens, 2025)

Societies that believe in democracy and equality need citizens who can think critically and responsibly to act mindfully, not only for themselves but also for the underprivileged and marginalized groups within society. Such confident, volunteer, and participative individuals take the lead to contribute to social affairs to meet challenges of society and safeguard the people from bullying, injustice and discrimination. The provision of citizenship education is the only way to produce such individuals who are beneficial for the whole society and always take the lead to raise their voice against prejudice, social inequality, intolerance, disrespect and misleading information. (Academy, 2021)

The developed countries, like the UK, the USA, and New Zealand, have already realized the importance and significance of citizenship education in their respective curricula. A British report, "The Ties that Bind", of the House of Lords session 2017-19 (2018) stated that the journey of refined and active citizenship starts with educating young students at school. The citizenship education gradually enables them to understand their active and participatory social roles within society. They explore their abilities and capabilities to perform their duties of active, responsible and well-informed citizens to improve their own lives and those of others. The British government urged shared values to be focused in their citizenship education. They believe that active and participatory citizenship encompasses respect, acceptance, courtesy, non-violence, political and social awareness, justice, social welfare, democratic approach and understanding of human fundamental rights. (Lords, 2018)

In developing countries like Pakistan, there is no mandatory or compulsory subject of citizenship education in the school curriculum. Regardless its different components have been integrated in different other subjects but it is great need of the time to re think and re visit the curriculum to save the declining society and its values. When a society does not focus on educating citizenship to its citizens, it slowly becomes a crowd of animals instead of refined and sensible citizens. People of that society become the victims of misinformation, social injustice, unlawfulness, discrimination, political and social bullying, violence, political and economic instability, and overall social disharmony. (Dean, 2005)

1.10 Conclusion

- It was concluded from the content analysis of the textbooks of the Punjab textbook board from grades 1 to 10 that there was no compulsory or mandatory subject of citizenship education in the school curriculum, but the traces and reflections of different areas of citizenship were identified in the taught subjects like English, Urdu, Islamiyat, General knowledge, Social Studies, Pakistan Studies and Geography. It was also concluded that the traces of all four areas and of their sub-categories were not the same. The sub-categories from area 1 (To interact effectively and constructively) and area 3 (To act in a socially responsible manner) were more reflected in the content of textbooks from grades 1 to 10 than the sub-categories from area 2 (To think critically) and area 4 (To act democratically).
- From the perspective of alignment of the content of school curriculum from grades 1 to 10 with active, practical and participatory citizenship, it was concluded that the sub-categories from area 1 (to act effectively and constructively) were aligned with active citizenship because the contents regarding confidence building, respect, courtesy and tolerance have been added. The matter of alignment with active and participative citizenship was the same in area 3 (to act in a socially responsible manner) because the contents regarding self-concept and awareness, how to

communicate and behave responsibly, emotional well-being, flexible attitude, responsibilities in diverse cultures, patriotism, solidarity and rights and responsibilities have been added.

- It was concluded that the sub-categories of area 2 (To think critically) and area 4 (To act democratically) were not well aligned with the contents of the curriculum from grades 1 to 10 because the sub-categories, like developing multi-perspectivity, how to develop reasoning skills, how to use judgments, how to discover new ways of problem solving, how to compete globally, understanding and acting in a democracy, knowing political processes, awareness of international organizations and their treaties have been least identified from the contents.
- It was recommended that a solid action plan was needed to develop the active and participative side of citizenship education in Pakistan. To avoid moral decline and decay of social and moral values, a compulsory subject of Citizenship/ Civic education may be added to the school curriculum, and the government authorities should legalize it in both public and private institutions. Only the addition of theoretical content would not be enough; a productive and willing mindset for learning practical skills for participatory citizenship may be needed. Different discussions, seminars and training sessions may be arranged for school teachers to train them for different aspects of citizenship education.

References

- Academy, T. G. (2021, March 16). *The Importance of Global Citizenship in 21st Century*. Retrieved from <https://www.theglobalcitizenacademy.com/blog/the-importance-of-global-citizenship-in-the-21st-century>: www.google.com
- Audsley, J., Chitty, C., O', C. J., Watson, D. M., & Wills, J. (2013, April 26). *Citizen Schools: Learning to rebuild democracy*. Retrieved from IPPR (online) <http://www.ippr.org/publications/55/11162/citizenship-school-learning-to-rebuild-democracy>.
- Birla, A. (2025, September). *Democracy and Education: The Role of Schools in Building Responsible Citizens*. Retrieved from <https://saralabirlaacademy.org/blog/democracy-and-education-role-of-schools/>: www.google.com
- Citizens, Y. (2025, september 18). *Importance of Citizenship Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.youngcitizens.org/resources/citizenship/importance-of-citizenship-education/>: www.google.com
- Coe, K., & Scacco, J. M. (2017). Quantitative Content Analysis. Florida, U.S.A: the International Encyclopedia of Communication Research Methods.
- Daas, D. R., & Munnikma, D. A. (2023, October 26). *What is the role of education in developing citizenship competencies*. Retrieved from <https://www.uva.nl/en/shared-content/faculteiten/en/faculteit-der-maatschappij-en-gedragswetenschappen/news/2021/02/elections--role-of-citizenship-education.html?cb:www.google.com>
- Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and*, 35-55.
- EACER Eurydice, E. (2017). *Citizenship Education in School in Europe*. Luxembourg: Eurydice Report Luxembourg Publications Office of the European Union.

- Flanagan, C. A., & Gally, L. S. (2007). School and Community Climates and Civic Commitments: Patterns for ethnic minority and majority students. *Journal of Educational Psychology* 99(2), 421-431.
- Flangan, C. A., & Stout, M. (2010 20(3)). Developmental patterns of social trust between early and late adolescence: Age and school climate effects. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 748-773.
- Gorard, S. (2020). Education can compensate for society ---- a Bit. *British Journal of Educational Studies* 58(1), 47-65.
- Hina, K., Dr, A. M., & Fazalur Rahman, D. (2011). State of Citizenship Education: A Case Study from Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Vol. 1 No. 2*.
- Jamieson, K. H. (2010). The Challenges Facing Civic Education. *American Academy of Arts and Science*.
- John, D., & Nick, H. (2015). The social psychology of citizenship, Participation and social exclusion: Introduction to the Special Thematic Section. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology* 3(2), 1-19.
- Joppke, C. (2007). Transformation of citizenship: Status, Rights, Identity. *Citizenship Studies* 11(1), 37-48.
- Keating, A. (2016). Educating tomorrow's citizens: What role can school play? *Foro de Education* 14(20), 35-47.
- Lords, T. H. (2018). *The Ties that Bind: Citizenship and Civic Engagement in 21st Century*. online at <https://www.parliament.uk/citizenship-civic-engagement>.
- Muhammad, Y. (2019). Pakistani National Identity, Curriculum Reform and Citizenship Education Textbooks: Understanding Teachers' Perspectives. *Journal of Research and Reflection in Education, Vol 13.No. 1*, 103-122.
- Naseer, R. (2012). Citizenship Education in Pakistan . *Pakistaniaat: A Journal of Pakistan Studies Vol. 4, No. 3*.
- Niemi, R. G., & Junn, J. (2005). *Civic Education: What Makes Students Learn?* New Haven CT: Yale University Press.
- Perveen, M. (2018). *Analysis of Curriculum with respect to citizenship education at sendary level in Punjab*. Retrieved from <http://pr.hec.gov.pk/jspui/bitstream/123456789/12069/1/Memuna%20perveen%20education%202018%20umt%20lhr%20pr.pdf>.
- Pimpton, A. (2025, September). *Teaching Citizenship: How Can We Prepare the Next Generation for the Complexities of Today's World?* Retrieved from <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/teaching-citizenship-how-can-we-prepare-the-next-generation-for-the-complexities-of-todays-world/>: www.google.com

Whiteley, P. (2005). *Citizenship Education Longitudinal Study Second Literature Review. Citizenship Education:: the political science perspective (DfES) Research Report 631.* . London: Department for Education and Skills.

ORIGINALITY REPORT

5%	5%	2%	%
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	archive.org Internet Source	1%
2	pn-lasusua.go.id Internet Source	1%
3	prp.hec.gov.pk Internet Source	1%
4	"Discourses of Globalisation and Citizenship Education", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2025 Publication	<1%
5	uwe-repository.worktribe.com Internet Source	<1%
6	Husnul Amin. "Value-based frameworks and peace education in faith-neutral, faith-based and faith-inspired schools in Islamabad: a comparative analysis", Journal of Peace Education, 2023 Publication	<1%
7	Uygun, Erdem. "Who are "Good Citizens" and How Can we Raise Them? Exploring the Perceptions of High School Students and Teachers in Turkey", Middle East Technical University (Turkey), 2024 Publication	<1%
8	acikbilim.yok.gov.tr Internet Source	<1%

9

Internet Source

<1 %

10

link.springer.com

Internet Source

<1 %

11

discovery.ucl.ac.uk

Internet Source

<1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches < 4 words


Exclude bibliography On

Jies

192-Other-532-1-2-20250920.docx

 Ams

 Ali

 Lahore College for Women University

Document Details

Submission ID

trn:oid::1:3365862806

Submission Date

Oct 8, 2025, 12:48 PM GMT+5

Download Date

Dec 3, 2025, 12:27 AM GMT+5

File Name

192-Other-532-1-2-20250920.docx

File Size

68.6 KB

15 Pages

5,674 Words

32,994 Characters



0% detected as AI

The percentage indicates the combined amount of likely AI-generated text as well as likely AI-generated text that was also likely AI-paraphrased.

Caution: Review required.

It is essential to understand the limitations of AI detection before making decisions about a student's work. We encourage you to learn more about Turnitin's AI detection capabilities before using the tool.

Detection Groups

-  **0 AI-generated only 0%**
Likely AI-generated text from a large-language model.
-  **0 AI-generated text that was AI-paraphrased 0%**
Likely AI-generated text that was likely revised using an AI-paraphrase tool or word spinner.

Disclaimer

Our AI writing assessment is designed to help educators identify text that might be prepared by a generative AI tool. Our AI writing assessment may not always be accurate (i.e., our AI models may produce either false positive results or false negative results), so it should not be used as the sole basis for adverse actions against a student. It takes further scrutiny and human judgment in conjunction with an organization's application of its specific academic policies to determine whether any academic misconduct has occurred.

Frequently Asked Questions

How should I interpret Turnitin's AI writing percentage and false positives?

The percentage shown in the AI writing report is the amount of qualifying text within the submission that Turnitin's AI writing detection model determines was either likely AI-generated text from a large-language model or likely AI-generated text that was likely revised using an AI paraphrase tool or word spinner.

False positives (incorrectly flagging human-written text as AI-generated) are a possibility in AI models.

AI detection scores under 20%, which we do not surface in new reports, have a higher likelihood of false positives. To reduce the likelihood of misinterpretation, no score or highlights are attributed and are indicated with an asterisk in the report (*%).

The AI writing percentage should not be the sole basis to determine whether misconduct has occurred. The reviewer/instructor should use the percentage as a means to start a formative conversation with their student and/or use it to examine the submitted assignment in accordance with their school's policies.

What does 'qualifying text' mean?

Our model only processes qualifying text in the form of long-form writing. Long-form writing means individual sentences contained in paragraphs that make up a longer piece of written work, such as an essay, a dissertation, or an article, etc. Qualifying text that has been determined to be likely AI-generated will be highlighted in cyan in the submission, and likely AI-generated and then likely AI-paraphrased will be highlighted purple.

Non-qualifying text, such as bullet points, annotated bibliographies, etc., will not be processed and can create disparity between the submission highlights and the percentage shown.



A Content Analysis Study on the State of Curriculum Fostering Citizenship Education in Punjab, Pakistan

Abstract

The current study aims to analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan, and the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical, and practical dimensions of citizenship education. The main research question was how much the school curriculum reflects the content of citizenship education, and to what extent the content of the school curriculum addresses the development and fostering of active citizenship among students. This study was based on quantitative content analysis. For this purpose, the textbooks of the Punjab textbook board from grades 1 to 10 were selected, which could have traces of citizenship education. For conducting content analysis, a framework of citizenship (EACER Eurydice, 2017) was selected as the research instrument, which had four major areas, and each one had its further sub-categories. It was concluded that the content showed more reflections of areas 1 and 3, which were about constructive interaction and being responsible towards others, whereas the least traces were identified of areas 2 and 4, which were about critical thinking and democratic behaviour. It was recommended to include a standalone subject of Citizenship Education in the curriculum.

Keywords: Citizenship, Citizenship Education. Fostering, PTB, Punjab

Introduction

Schools should teach their students citizenship from their initial classes because citizenship education encompasses how people behave and participate in society. It covers social, political, and religious knowledge, human attitudes, and living skills. Schools should teach their students to develop tolerance and mutual respect for other citizens who might have different opinions and points of view. (Daas & Munniksmma, 2023) From the start of this century, the developed countries started focusing on the need for citizenship education in the schools because of globalization and diverse social cohesion. Schools can be taken as the first and most important place where students can learn how to behave socially and how to participate democratically in a pluralistic circle. (Flangan & Stout, 2010 20(3))The last twenty-five years have played their vital role in highlighting and transforming the need for citizenship education in schools. In citizenship education, the students are guided to find and explore their social identities, their rights and duties as citizens of the concerned nation. The teachers teach them to value not only themselves but also their fellow beings based on equality, justice, peace and mutual harmony. (Keating, 2016)

The concept of citizenship has a broad spectrum. It covers legal identities like a national card and a passport, social duties and rights, and social responsibilities like voting in the elections and tax payments, volunteering for social welfare and noble causes. (Joppke, 2007) In his study, Keating (2014) made the notable point that citizens worldwide learn values, norms, attitudes, and behaviour from their environment. They do not inherit them. That is why he emphasized the role of school in teaching and educating students regarding all necessary attributes and dimensions of good citizenship. (Keating, 2016)

Gorard (2010) claimed that schools and citizenship are closely linked and interrelated to each other since the 18th century because he took educational institutions or schools as a medium or instrument to identify and solve social issues of the concerned society. Education and citizenship have a vital bond, and schools play their role in teaching students about civic sense. According to cognitive

experts, education literate students and develop their mental, social, cognitive, psychosocial, behavioural, emotional, religious and moral dimensions so that the students may enable themselves to receive, understand and respond to all information around them regarding society, politics and religion. (Whiteley, 2005) Education starts refining students from their early age to understand civic engagement and their responsibilities. Gradually, with higher qualifications, students can feel the long-lasting impacts of citizenship education on their lives. (Niemi & Junn, 2005)

A school takes its curriculum as an instrument or a valuable tool to teach its students directly or indirectly all possible dimensions of citizenship. The schools play their role through their formal and hidden curriculum in the cultivation and inculcation of citizenship values, norms, beliefs, rights, sense of responsibility, political and democratic sense, mutual respect and critical thinking and decision making in the students. (Flanagan & Gallay, 2007) In developed countries, schools do not focus on just theoretical knowledge of citizenship, but also provide opportunities to students to practice citizenship by working with the community and engaging and participating in social work, for example, social work on a volunteer basis. raising funds for charities, raising money to pay fees of the poor students, small social projects and instructional tasks to understand and resolve social issues of the community. Such activities enable the students to get experiential learning through the development of civic skills. (Audsley, J, et al, 2013) Schools have a great responsibility to cultivate and inculcate citizenship in students, not only for the sake of youth but also for the sake of the entire society (Gorard, 2020)

The inculcation of citizenship through citizenship education is highly important for every society but unfortunately, in developing and under developed countries, if they ignore citizenship education, their society tends to face severe drawbacks like distribution of unequal resources among different classes of society, suppression of marginalized groups of society, severe violations of human rights because power belongs to wrong hands and they use it for their illegal interests, racial and ethnic issues, unequal opportunities of education, gender discrimination issues, disproportionate and unequal medical and health care for the individuals, lack of democracy, lack of social and political unpredictability, lack of social strength, lack of economic instability, lack of decision making, lack of critical thinking, lack of freedom of self-expression, severe unrest of youth leading to violence because of disempowerment, terrorism, street crimes, unemployment, development of destructive or terror groups in society, lack of legal shield and protection for individuals, increasing unproductivity and disappointment within people of society, detachment between people and the government, lack of mutual trust and respect, lack of social accountability and increase in corruption and vulnerability of citizens. (John & Nick, 2015)

In Pakistan, like other developing countries, citizenship is not a stand-alone subject in the curriculum but is integrated into other subjects like Pakistan Studies, Social Studies, Geography, Urdu, and English. A study of (Muhammad, 2019) showed that in Pakistani curricula, Pakistan Studies is most closely associated with Citizenship Education. The author further claimed that Pakistani teachers wanted to see Pakistani students as good citizens and true Muslims as well, because they appreciated and desired a more Islamic perspective on human values within society. This study explained the role of the school curriculum in citizenship education and how citizenship could be taught to school students.

1.1 Statement of the Problem

When a society does not focus on citizenship education, the people become the victims of misinformation, lack of knowledge, economic instability, political decline, lack of knowledge of fundamental human rights, social conflicts, corruption, terrorism, lack of confidence and social

disharmony. (Pimpton, 2025) In every society, schools may play their dynamic role in educating youth about citizenship. The school teaches the students about morality, ethics, fundamental human rights, problem-solving and critical thinking skills, responsibilities in a diverse culture, active participation in society and maintaining social harmony through curriculum, teaching methodologies and a favourable outer environment. (Birla, 2025).

Like other developing countries, Pakistan is not focusing on the vital need of citizenship education, which is why Pakistani students face challenges both at the national and global levels. They face injustice, inequality, unlawfulness, corruption, intolerance, discrimination, disrespect, political instability, economic setbacks, lack of basic fundamental human rights, freedom of expression, lack of social welfare and lack of democratic opportunities. (Perveen, 2018) The Pakistani curriculum does not enable students to think critically to bring sustainable social change. (Naseer, 2012). This disturbing situation points out the significance of curriculum in citizenship education. Therefore, this study focused on “The role of curriculum in fostering citizenship education in Pakistan”

1.2 Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the study were to:

- analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan.
- study the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical and practical dimensions of citizenship education.

1.3 Research Questions

Research questions for this current study were:

- How much does the school curriculum reflect the content of citizenship education?
- To what extent does the content of the school curriculum address the development and fostering of active citizenship among students?

1.4 Significance of the study

In the Pakistani school curriculum, the subject of citizenship education is not included as a standalone or compulsory subject, whereas it is integrated with other subjects like social studies, Pakistan studies, geography, history, Urdu and English. It is the need of the time to rethink and add a mandatory subject of citizenship education to promote active and participatory dimensions of citizenship education among young students. (Dean, 2005)

A study (Hina et al., 2011) cited the fundamental components of active citizenship education that need to be focused on in the school curriculum, like an understanding of nature and the characteristics of society. gender roles and the nature of mutual relationships of the common public, an understanding of common rights and duties for each other, a belief in no gender discrimination or gender biases, an understanding of the effectiveness of democratic decisions, an understanding of basic laws and justice among people, critical thinking, and active participatory skills.

In developing countries, the public faces many problems because of a lack of citizenship, like low political vision, less public information, and a low public literacy rate. passive attitude towards fellow beings with minimum participatory skills, lack of public welfare activities, less understanding

of mutual rights and duties, lack of interest in social work and democratic decisions, less understanding of social and global issues, lack of volunteerism for the common good, social, emotional and moral manipulation, high ratio of vulnerability among people and less information of social ground realities of that society. (Jamieson, 2010) Like other developing countries, the Pakistani youth also face these problems. Therefore, the findings of this study would highlight the need for more content on citizenship in the school curriculum to lead the school students to develop active, dynamic and participatory citizenship skills.

1.5 Delimitations of the Study

To achieve the research objectives, 1. To analyze the extent of citizenship education content in the school curriculum of the Punjab, Pakistan, and 2. To study the alignment of the content of the school curriculum with active, critical and practical dimensions of citizenship education, this study was delimited to the selected subjects from the school curriculum of the Punjab Textbook Board of Pakistan to analyze all the possible traces of citizenship education. The details are as follows:

Grades and Selected subjects
Grade 1: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 2: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 3: Urdu, English, General Knowledge, and Islamic Studies
Grade 4: Social studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic studies
Grade 5: Social studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic studies
Grade 6: Urdu, English, Islamic Studies, and Geography
Grade 7: English, Urdu, Islamic Studies and Geography
Grade 8: Urdu, English, Islamic Studies and Geography
Grade 9: Pakistan Studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic Studies
Grade 10: Pakistan Studies, Urdu, English, and Islamic Studies

1.6 Methodology of the Study

This study was based on quantitative content analysis. The quantitative content analysis is a useful research method that encompasses textual, audio and video data that are gathered and arranged systematically so that they can be analyzed. The most important feature of content analysis is its coding, or a specific framework that includes a set of indicators that need to be looked for in the textual content. A useful and successful content analysis needs to combine some significant aspects, like careful segmentation and selection of the text and using a reliable framework of coding that thoroughly covers that specific topic. (Coe & Scacco, 2017)

1.7 Population and Sample

To conduct quantitative content analysis, the textbooks of the Punjab Textbook Board from grades 1 to 10 were taken, and for the sample, all those subjects were selected that could have possible traces of citizenship education

1.8 Research Instrument

For quantitative content analysis, the researcher sought to employ a framework that could encompass all important dimensions and their subcategories of citizenship education. After extensive reading, the researcher selected a comprehensive and wide-ranging framework of citizenship education from a European report, “Citizenship Education at School in Europe 2017”, which not only covered vital areas of citizenship education but also its detailed subcategories. It covered four vital areas, like dimensions of constructive and effective interaction with people and their sub-categories, the dimension of behaving responsibly with its sub-competencies, the aspect of critical thinking and all its further sub-categories and the major dimension of participating in society and acting democratically with its sub-competencies. (EACER Eurydice, 2017)

1.9 Data Collection and Data Analysis

To conduct quantitative content analysis, the researcher arranged the selected books from grades 1 to 10 of the Punjab Textbook Board. After careful and extensive reading of those books, content analysis was done by using the concise framework of citizenship education (EACER Eurydice, 2017). This framework had 4 major areas, and each area had its further sub-categories or further competencies. The researcher conducted the content analysis through careful and extensive reading of the texts to find out all possible traces and reflections of citizenship education. The researcher tabulated the data to show the traces of citizenship education according to the instrument that had major areas and their further sub-categories.

Table 1.

Grade 1. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 4 (%)
English 90%	46%	55%	36%	
Urdu	92%	42%	52%	35%
General 77%	64%	80%	52%	
Knowledge				

Table 1 shows that in the English textbook grade 1, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 46% of sub-categories from area 2, 55% sub-categories from area 3 and 36% sub-categories from area 4 were found. In the textbook of Urdu grade 1, 92% of the sub-categories from area 1, 42% sub-categories from area 2, 52% sub-categories from area 3 and 35% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 1, 77% of sub-categories of area 1, 64% sub-categories from area 2, 80% sub-categories from area 3 and 52% sub-categories from area 4 were found.

Table 2.

Grade 2. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	64%	53%	29%	35%
Urdu	90%	98%	96%	52%
General Knowledge	85%	77%	95%	73%

Table 2 shows that in the English textbook for grade 2, 64% of sub-categories from area 1, 53% of sub-categories from area 2, 29% of sub-categories from area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 2, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 98% sub-categories from area 2, 96% sub-categories from area 3 and 52% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 2, 85% of the sub-categories of area 1, 77% sub-categories from area 2, 95% sub-categories from area 3 and 73% sub-categories from area 4 were traced.

Table 3.

Grade 3. Grade 2. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 4 (%)
English	56%	40%	60%	22%

Urdu	90%	95%	96%	38%
General Knowledge	91%	87%	88%	60%
Islamiyat	90%	60%	68%	36%

Table 3 shows that in the English textbook for grade 3, 56% of sub-categories from area 1, 40% of sub-categories from area 2, 60% of sub-categories from area 3, and 22% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 3, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 95% sub-categories from area 2, 96% sub-categories from area 3 and 38% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of General Knowledge grade 3, 91% of the sub-categories of area 1, 87% sub-categories from area 2, 88% sub-categories from area 3 and 60% sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 60% of sub-categories from area 2, 68% of sub-categories from area 3, and 36% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 4.

Grade 4 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	64%	80%	48%
Urdu	90%	88%	95%	47%
Social Studies	95%	96%	94%	85%
Islamiyat	90%	76%	88%	24%

Table 4. shows that in the English textbook for grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 64% of sub-categories from area 2, 80% of sub-categories from area 3, and 48% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 4, 90% of the sub-categories from area 1, 88% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 47% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Social Studies grade 4, 95% of sub-categories of area 1, 96% of sub-categories from area 2, 94% sub-categories from area 3 and 85% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 4, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 88% of sub-categories from area 3, and 24% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 5.

Grade 5. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	88%	80%	35%
Urdu	82%	95%	96%	23%
Social Studies	96%	96%	95%	86%
Islamiyat	90%	76%	96%	35%

Table 5. shows that in the English textbook for grade 5, 90% of sub-categories from Area 1, 88% of sub-categories from Area 2, 80% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 5, 82% of the sub-categories from area 1, 95% of sub-categories from area 2, 96% of sub-categories from area 3 and 23% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Social Studies grade 5, 96% of sub-categories of area 1, 96% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 86% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat, grade 5, 90% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 96% of sub-categories from area 3, and 35% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 6.

Grade 6. Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	90%	88%	60%	10%
Urdu	32%	20%	70%	10%
Islamiyat	55%	zero%	70%	23%

Table 8.

Grade 8. Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
Subject	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	40%	32%	62%	10%
Urdu	52%	10%	95%	14%
Islamiyat	65%	24%	52%	27%
Geography	7%	76%	52%	0%

Table 8. shows that in the English textbook for grade 8, 40% of sub-categories from Area 1, 32% of sub-categories from Area 2, 62% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Urdu grade 8, 52% of the sub-categories from area 1, 10% of sub-categories from area 2, 95% of sub-categories from area 3 and 14% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 8, 65% of sub-categories of area 1, 24% % of sub-categories from area 2, 52%of sub-categories from area 3 and 27% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Geography, grade 8, 7% of sub-categories from area 1, 76% of sub-categories from area 2, 52% of sub-categories from area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from area 4 were identified.

Table 9.

Grade 9 Sub-categories of the four major areas

	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
Subject	sub-categories in Area. .1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. .3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	56%	64%	80%	10%
Urdu	32%	32%	53%	10%
Islamiyat	51%	0%	16%	10%
Pakistan	56%	54%	90%	77%

Studies

Table 9. shows that in the English textbook for grade 9, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 64% of sub-categories from Area 2, 80% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 10% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the Urdu textbook for grade 9, 32% of the sub-categories from area 1, 32% of the sub-categories from area 2, 53% of the sub-categories from area 3, and 10% of the sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 9, 51% of sub-categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 16%of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Pakistan Studies, grade 9, 56% of sub-categories from Area 1, 54% of sub-categories from Area 2, 90% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 77% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified.

Table 10.

Grade 10 Sub-categories of the four major areas

Subject	To interact effectively And constructively democratically	To think critically	To act in a socially responsible manner	To act
	sub-categories in Area. 1 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 2 (%)	sub-categories in Area. 3 (%)	sub-categories in Area.4 (%)
English	65%	54%	16%	0%
Urdu	31%	0%	43%	10%
Islamiyat	64%	0%	43%	10%
Pakistan Studies	15%	21%	61%	77%

Table 10 shows that in the English textbook for grade 10, 65% of sub-categories from Area 1, 54% of sub-categories from Area 2, 16% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 0% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified. In the Urdu textbook for grade 10, 31% of the sub-categories from area 1, 0% of the sub-categories from area 2, 43% of the sub-categories from area 3, and 10% of the sub-categories from area 4 were identified. In the textbook of Islamiyat grade 10, 64% of sub-categories of area 1, 0% % of sub-categories from area 2, 43%of sub-categories from area 3 and 10% of sub-categories from area 4 were traced. In the textbook of Pakistan Studies, grade 10, 15% of sub-categories from Area 1, 21% of sub-categories from Area 2, 61% of sub-categories from Area 3, and 77% of sub-categories from Area 4 were identified.

1.9 Discussion

Young Citizens (2025) stated that the need for citizenship education has never been greater in this century. It has become the basic need of the hour because it helps the youth to acquire skills like critical thinking, media awareness, and active social participation to face new challenges like handling global climatic changes, inculcation of ethical and moral values, and understanding the fabrication of information at the national and global levels. The provision of citizenship education can play its vital role in fostering respect, acceptance and courtesy for diverse cultures in society, social involvement to

ensure justice for all and the ability to distinguish between information and misinformation to behave responsibly and sensibly in this interconnected and global world. (Citizens, 2025)

Societies that believe in democracy and equality need citizens who can think critically and responsibly to act mindfully, not only for themselves but also for the underprivileged and marginalized groups within society. Such confident, volunteer, and participative individuals take the lead to contribute to social affairs to meet challenges of society and safeguard the people from bullying, injustice and discrimination. The provision of citizenship education is the only way to produce such individuals who are beneficial for the whole society and always take the lead to raise their voice against prejudice, social inequality, intolerance, disrespect and misleading information. (Academy, 2021)

The developed countries, like the UK, the USA, and New Zealand, have already realized the importance and significance of citizenship education in their respective curricula. A British report, "The Ties that Bind", of the House of Lords session 2017-19 (2018) stated that the journey of refined and active citizenship starts with educating young students at school. The citizenship education gradually enables them to understand their active and participatory social roles within society. They explore their abilities and capabilities to perform their duties of active, responsible and well-informed citizens to improve their own lives and those of others. The British government urged shared values to be focused in their citizenship education. They believe that active and participatory citizenship encompasses respect, acceptance, courtesy, non-violence, political and social awareness, justice, social welfare, democratic approach and understanding of human fundamental rights. (Lords, 2018)

In developing countries like Pakistan, there is no mandatory or compulsory subject of citizenship education in the school curriculum. Regardless its different components have been integrated in different other subjects but it is great need of the time to re think and re visit the curriculum to save the declining society and its values. When a society does not focus on educating citizenship to its citizens, it slowly becomes a crowd of animals instead of refined and sensible citizens. People of that society become the victims of misinformation, social injustice, unlawfulness, discrimination, political and social bullying, violence, political and economic instability, and overall social disharmony. (Dean, 2005)

1.10 Conclusion

- It was concluded from the content analysis of the textbooks of the Punjab textbook board from grades 1 to 10 that there was no compulsory or mandatory subject of citizenship education in the school curriculum, but the traces and reflections of different areas of citizenship were identified in the taught subjects like English, Urdu, Islamiyat, General knowledge, Social Studies, Pakistan Studies and Geography. It was also concluded that the traces of all four areas and of their sub-categories were not the same. The sub-categories from area 1 (To interact effectively and constructively) and area 3 (To act in a socially responsible manner) were more reflected in the content of textbooks from grades 1 to 10 than the sub-categories from area 2 (To think critically) and area 4 (To act democratically).
- From the perspective of alignment of the content of school curriculum from grades 1 to 10 with active, practical and participatory citizenship, it was concluded that the sub-categories from area 1 (to act effectively and constructively) were aligned with active citizenship because the contents regarding confidence building, respect, courtesy and tolerance have been added. The matter of alignment with active and participative citizenship was the same in area 3 (to act in a socially responsible manner) because the contents regarding self-concept and awareness, how to

communicate and behave responsibly, emotional well-being, flexible attitude, responsibilities in diverse cultures, patriotism, solidarity and rights and responsibilities have been added.

- It was concluded that the sub-categories of area 2 (To think critically) and area 4 (To act democratically) were not well aligned with the contents of the curriculum from grades 1 to 10 because the sub-categories, like developing multi-perspectivity, how to develop reasoning skills, how to use judgments, how to discover new ways of problem solving, how to compete globally, understanding and acting in a democracy, knowing political processes, awareness of international organizations and their treaties have been least identified from the contents.
- It was recommended that a solid action plan was needed to develop the active and participative side of citizenship education in Pakistan. To avoid moral decline and decay of social and moral values, a compulsory subject of Citizenship/ Civic education may be added to the school curriculum, and the government authorities should legalize it in both public and private institutions. Only the addition of theoretical content would not be enough; a productive and willing mindset for learning practical skills for participatory citizenship may be needed. Different discussions, seminars and training sessions may be arranged for school teachers to train them for different aspects of citizenship education.

References

- Academy, T. G. (2021, March 16). *The Importance of Global Citizenship in 21st Century*. Retrieved from <https://www.theglobalcitizenacademy.com/blog/the-importance-of-global-citizenship-in-the-21st-century>: www.google.com
- Audsley, J., Chitty, C., O", C. J., Watson, D. M., & Wills, J. (2013, April 26). *Citizen Schools: Learning to rebuild democracy*. Retrieved from IPPR (online) <http://www.ippr.org/publications/55/11162/citizenship-school-learning-to-rebuild-democracy>.
- Birla, A. (2025, September). *Democracy and Education: The Role of Schools in Building Responsible Citizens*. Retrieved from <https://saralabirilaacademy.org/blog/democracy-and-education-role-of-schools/>: www.google.com
- Citizens, Y. (2025, september 18). *Importance of Citizenship Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.youngcitizens.org/resources/citizenship/importance-of-citizenship-education/>: www.google.com
- Coe, K., & Scacco, J. M. (2017). *Quantitative Content Analysis*. Florida, U.S.A: the International Encyclopedia of Communication Research Methods.
- Daas, D. R., & Munniksm, D. A. (2023, October 26). *What is the role of education in developing citizenship competencies*. Retrieved from <https://www.uva.nl/en/shared-content/faculteiten/en/faculteit-der-maatschappij-en-gedragwetenschappen/news/2021/02/elections---role-of-citizenship-education.html?cb>: www.google.com
- Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and*, 35-55.
- EACER Eurydice, E. (2017). *Citizenship Education in School in Europe*. Luxembourg: Eurydice Report Luxembourg Publications Office of the European Union.

- Flanagan, C. A., & Gally, L. S. (2007). School and Community Climates and Civic Commitments: Pptterns for ethnic minority and majority students. *Journal of Educational Psychology*99(2), 421-431.
- Flangan, C. A., & Stout, M. (2010 20(3)). Developmental patterns of social trust between early and late adolescence: Age and school climate effects. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 748-773.
- Gorard, S. (2020). Education can compensate for society ---- a Bit. *British Journal of Educational Studies* 58(1), 47-65.
- Hina, K., Dr, A. M., & Fazalur Rahman, D. (2011). State of Citizenship Education: A Case Study from Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Vol. 1 No. 2*.
- Jamieson, K. H. (2010). The Challenges Facing Civic Education. *American Academy of Arts and Science*.
- John, D., & Nick, H. (2015). The social psychology of citizenship, Participatiion and social exclsion: Introduction to the Special Thematic Section. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology* 3(2), 1-19.
- Joppke, C. (2007). Transformation of citizenship: Status, Rights, Identity. *Citizenship Studies* 11(1), 37-48.
- Keating, A. (2016). Educating tomorrow's citizens: What role can school play? *Foro de Education* 14(20), 35-47.
- Lords, T. H. (2018). *The Ties that Bind: Citizenship and Civic Engagement in 21st Century*. online at <https://www.parliament.uk/citizenship-civic-engagement>.
- Muhammad, Y. (2019). Pakistani National Identity, Curriculum Reform and Citizenship Education Textbooks: Understanding Teachers' Perspectives. *Journal of Research and Reflectionin Education, Vol 13.No. 1*, 103-122.
- Naseer, R. (2012). Citizenship Education in Pakistan . *Pakistaniaat: A Journal of Pakistan Studies Vol. 4, No. 3*.
- Niemi, R. G., & Junn, J. (2005). *Civic Education: What Makes Students Learn?* New Haven CT: Yale University Press.
- Perveen, M. (2018). *Analysis of Curriculum with respect to citizenship education at sendary level in Punjab*. Retrieved from <http://pr.hec.gov.pk/jspui/bitstream/123456789/12069/1/Memuna%20perveen%20education%202018%20umt%20lhr%20pr.pdf>.
- Pimpton, A. (2025, September). *Teaching Citizenship: How Can We Prepare the Next Generation for the Complexities of Today's World?* Retrieved from <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/teaching-citizenship-how-can-we-prepare-the-next-generation-for-the-complexities-of-todays-world/>: www.google.com

Whiteley, P. (2005). *Citizenship Education Longitudinal Study Second Literature Review. Citizenship Education:: the political science perspective (DfES) Research Report 631.* . London: Department for Education and Skills.

Manuscript Review Form

Title: “A Content Analysis Study on the State of Curriculum Fostering Citizenship Education in Punjab, Pakistan”

Evaluation Criteria	Yes	No	Comments
Title of the manuscript appropriate?	√		
Does abstract accurately reflect the content?	√		
Is theoretical and practical content of the study clearly identified?	√		
Is the literature cited correctly and up-to-date?	√		
Is the Method clearly stated and appropriate?	√		
Is the procedure Clearly and appropriately stated	√		
Are the ethical guidelines followed?	√		
Are the results appropriately described?			
Are the appropriate statistical procedures used?			
Are the tables and Figures as per APA Guidelines?			
Are the findings concluded in appropriate manner?			
Are the findings appropriately interpreted in discussion section?			

Is the overall writing, Clear and unambiguous?			
Is the manuscript written according to APA?		√	

Final Comments and Recommendation:

Overall, the article is well-written and provides useful insights; however, several areas require improvement. The introduction lacks clarity and needs to be rewritten for a stronger and more engaging start. The significance of the study is not adequately explained and requires further elaboration. Heading of tables should be italic. The author also needs to follow APA formatting guidelines more consistently, and the end references should be written properly according to the required style. This article will suitable for publication after making major ammendments.



Dr. Ayesha Batool
Assistant Professor
Lahore College for Women University

Manuscript Review Form

Title: “A Content Analysis Study on the State of Curriculum Fostering Citizenship Education in Punjab, Pakistan”

Evaluation Criteria	Yes	No	Comments
Title of the manuscript appropriate?			The topic of the paper, is somewhat unclear. It would benefit from being more specific about what aspect of citizenship education or which dimensions of the curriculum are being analyzed. Clarifying the focus will help readers immediately understand the scope and aim of the study. You may consider : “Fostering Citizenship Education in Punjab: A Content Analysis of School Curricula in Punjab”
Does abstract accurately reflect the content?	yes		Situate the study within the broader context of citizenship education by writing one or two background sentences. Use academic language and check for language editing
Is theoretical and practical content of the study clearly identified?		No	
Is the literature cited correctly and up-to-date?	To some extent		
Is the Method clearly stated and appropriate?	Yes		
Is the procedure Clearly and appropriately stated	Yes		
Are the ethical guidelines followed?			No statement provided
Are the results appropriately described?	Yes		
Are the appropriate statistical procedures used?		Not Clear	
Are the tables and Figures as per APA Guidelines?	Yes		

Are the findings concluded in appropriate manner?			Generic claims not substantiated by evidence
Are the findings appropriately interpreted in discussion section?		no	
Is the overall writing, Clear and unambiguous?			Need language editing
Is the manuscript written according to APA?			

**Final Comments and Recommendations:
Accepted with all corrections.**

Dr. Farah Naz

Designation: University pf Vienna, Austria